



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

THE RUSSIAN JEWS.

EXTERMINATION OR EMANCIPATION ? *

UNDER this title, M. Leo Erréra, Professor of Natural History at the University of Brussels, has produced a most valuable and succinct account of the Jews of Russia. Every available source in the Russian, French, and English archives, has been placed under contribution for the facts so simply, yet so convincingly detailed ; whilst journals as recent as the *Volkshod*, of July last, and the *Novoïe Vremia*, of August and September, 1893, are also cited. In a short prefatory letter, Professor Mommsen expresses his entire sympathy with the victims of intolerance in Russia, and he adds the hope, that the veil of blindness may fall away from the eyes of those misguided Russian statesmen, who act in a manner worthy of a resuscitated Torquemada.

M. Erréra divides his subject into four sections. In the first part, he treats of the attitude of former rulers of Russia towards their Jewish subjects. In the second part, he dwells on the various measures of persecution ; the restrictions as to residence in townships ; the expulsion of artisans, etc. ; as also the ever-increasing limitations put upon education. The third portion of the book details the several accusations brought against the Jews, in attempts to justify the persecutions inflicted upon them, and the fourth part contains the possible " Solutions " of the Jewish question.

The introductory portion describes the condition of the Jews from the time when, in the third century before the Christian Era, they first entered Russia, until the days of its present ruler. Under this monarch, and under his two immediate predecessors, the intolerance displayed against the modern prototypes of Egyptian bondage, waxed ever more violent, until it attained the outrageous proportions that it has assumed in our own times ; but even the Pharaohs were ignorant of, or did not exercise that refinement of cruelty which consists in over-crowding human beings within fixed limits to such an extent, that they are actually decimated by the fell diseases which they themselves engender in their midst.

* *Les Juifs Russes, Extermination ou Emancipation ?* Par Leo Erréra, Professor de Bruxelles, Membre Correspondent de l'Académie Royale de Belgique. Avec une lettre-préface de T. G. Mommsen.

"The Jews," says M. Erréra, "are not intruders in the Great Slav Empire, but must be reckoned among its most ancient inhabitants." "At the time when Alexander the Great conquered Asia, the Israelites established themselves in all the Greek communities of any importance, and particularly in all the maritime cities." "To this first immigration which dates back to the third century before the common era, belong without doubt, the most ancient Israelite elements who dwelt in Central Russia and in the Crimea."

Towards the seventh century, a Finnish people who lived on the banks of the Volga, and were known as Chazars, became for the greater part converted to Judaism, together with their king and his nobles. The Jewish learned men who effected this act of proselytism had fled to Russia from the persecution of the Byzantine Emperors. "This kingdom of the Chazars was overthrown towards the close of the tenth century by Swieteslav, a Russian prince of Kiev, and the remnant of the vanquished people took refuge in the Crimea, and became fused with the Jewish community, which for centuries past had existed there."

The Caraites, a Jewish sect, who rejected the Talmud and who appear to have been in existence at the time of the conversion of the Chazars, now began to acquire some importance in Palestine, and also established themselves in the Crimea, where, however, they remained quite distinct from the Jews. Even at the present day they are not considered as Jews by the Russian Government, and are consequently exempt from the persecutions inflicted on that race.

In the eleventh century, the Jews emigrated into Poland, and Casimir the Great gave them the right of free locomotion, and permitted them to engage in any trade they chose; he also gave to their Rabbinical tribunals the right of judgment, and protected them against the intolerance of fanatics. At the latter end of the seventeenth century, Chmielnicki, the Chief of the Cossacks, assisted by the Russians and Tartars, invaded and vanquished Poland, and treated both Jews and Catholics with equal severity. The Israelites of Poland never again recovered from the disasters in which 200,000 of their number were killed. In the eighteenth century, when Russia extended its possessions towards the West and the South, a great portion of the territory occupied by the Israelites became incorporated within the new frontier lines. One cannot therefore reasonably speak of an invasion made by the Jews upon Russia; on the contrary, the Russians, both in the eighteenth century, and in our days, have encroached on those regions which were chiefly peopled by Jews.

The Jewish question first began to assume grave proportions in Russia when the frontier lands, which were populated by great

numbers of Jews, became part of the Russian Empire. At the time when White Russia became incorporated, however, there was no attempt made to disestablish the Jews, who enjoyed various privileges, and were the leading representatives of certain trades. To turn them away would simply have brought about the ruin of all the provinces, where the chief industries had become vested in the hands of the Jewish inhabitants. M. de Gradowski, a Councillor of State, even asserts (from documentary evidence in his possession) that Catherine II. actually granted all the rights of other Russian subjects to the Jews, and that she desired complete emancipation for them, but under the pretext of interpreting the wishes of the Empress, the Senate issued various restrictive measures. These senatorial ukases of 1786, 1791, and 1794 are beyond doubt, the original causes of all the calamities from which the Russian Israelites are now suffering. "From that time the Jews were restricted within the district of the Settlement of the Pale, they were deprived of the right of free locomotion (a right which all lawyers declared to be indefeasible), and these limitations were brought about by the Senate, not by the Empress. From that period began the terrible strife which makes the history of the Russian Jews a long dreary conflict, so that one is almost induced to believe that the ghost of the Middle Ages, the spirit of rampant intolerance, which it was hoped had been laid for all time, has now once more come to life. Under Alexander and Nicholas, the territory which the Jews were permitted to inhabit, was considerably diminished in extent by the prohibition that they should not establish themselves within fifty versts of the frontier."

"It was also intended that they should not be allowed to reside in any part of the country whatsoever, but that they should restrict themselves wholly to the cities and townships. This project would have actually been carried into effect had not the Minister of the Interior represented to the Czar that such a measure would simply cause numberless Jews to perish of starvation." In 1812, a Commission, of which Popoff was at the head, gave a favourable report of the Jews of Poland and the White Territory, and advised that various disabilities with regard to their rights of residence should be set aside. These representations, however, were not only entirely disregarded, but Nicholas still further limited the Pale of Territory, and closed the cities of Kiev, Nicolaeiv, and Sebastopol against the Jews. Under Alexander II., a generous-hearted prince, the position of the Jews was so far ameliorated that they began once more to hope for entire emancipation. There was every reason to believe that after liberating the serfs, he would act in a like manner to the Jews, and that he would also establish a Parliamentary

Assemblage in Russia. But unfortunately his life was cut short by violence, and reactionary principles again became dominant.

In 1882, the famous "May Laws" were elaborated by General Ignatieff, whose hatred of the Jews was notorious. The actual result of these enactments may be briefly summed up in the words attributed to M. Pobédonostsev, the Procurator of the Holy Synod :—"A third will be converted, a third will emigrate, and a third will die of starvation." But outraged public opinion (fortunately for poor suffering humanity) does occasionally lift up its voice, and in 1890 an immense and representative public meeting was held at the Guildhall, in London, to give expression to the strong feeling prevalent in England. This meeting was held as a protest against the Russian persecution of the Jews, and more especially to denounce certain new oppressive laws which were about to be enacted, and which threatened to plunge the Jews of Russia and Poland into yet greater depths of misery, by limiting their residence exclusively to the cities. But, as M. Erréra says, "the respectful petition addressed to the Czar, as the outcome of the meeting in London, was returned, through diplomatic channels, unopened !"

As the Census does not exist in Russia, one can only judge approximately of the number of its inhabitants, and take as a guide the figures given by the Central Statistical Committee. The annual Report of the Committee, in 1890, gives the number of inhabitants as 93,703,331 souls (exclusive of Finland and the Caucasus), whilst the Jews are entered at 4,500,000 souls.

"The number of Jews in other quarters of the globe being under four millions, it is evident that Russia in Europe contains half the Jewish population of the globe. Therefore the Jews constitute 5 per cent. of the population of Russia, exclusive of those living in the Territory. Within the Pale the proportion is 12 to 13 per cent., and in Russian Poland 13 to 14 per cent. of the population. The Territory where the Jews are permitted to dwell comprises the ten ancient provinces of Poland, and fifteen of the Governments out of fifty in Russia proper, which district is known as the "Jewish Pale of Settlement."

The condition of those who dwell in the vast Ghetto of the Pale is horrible beyond all description. In places where they constitute the chief portion of the population, *three Jews* have to live in the space that is occupied by *one Christian*, and "*the corners of their living rooms*" are actually "*sub-let to whole families*."

"But," as Erréra justly observes, "physical endurance has its limits." If the state of things does not change, and if this change does not soon occur, "if the Israelites are not permitted to spread

themselves, at any rate, over the surface of the entire Territory, the close of the nineteenth century will assist with horror at a catastrophe for which the Russian Legislature alone will be responsible, and which may be expected from day to day." "An epidemic of Typhus, brought about by crowding to such excess, will attack hundreds of thousands, and will spread throughout Europe." Typhus, in all its horrors, is already endemic in Poland, and within the Jewish Pale of Settlement.

The author traces the progress of the persecution from 1883 to 1890, and shows how the meshes of the net which spread over the heads of the unfortunate people, have been drawn ever closer and closer. They have been hunted from one spot to another; they have been driven from places which had hitherto been classed as townships, under the pretext that such spots were no longer to be considered as townships, but as villages, and in these they are not permitted to reside.

The important boroughs of Palitski and Rechilovko, which had always been considered as cities, and were so designated in official documents, became suddenly changed into villages; at the arbitrary will of the officials. In February, 1891, all the Jews of Novgorod were ordered to leave that city, and repair to the Pale. In Moscow (the Holy City), which numbered 30,000 Jews among its inhabitants, similar orders to quit immediately were given; no exceptions were made. Veterans who had been wounded in battle, Paralytics, Pregnant Women, the Sick, all were treated alike, and all were driven forth without mercy, many of them being laden with handcuffs. Whilst these expulsions were being enforced in Moscow and elsewhere, measures were adopted to render it illegal for Jewish artisans to remain in St. Petersburg. It has been calculated that from 1882 to 1890, more than 10,000 workmen were compelled to quit the capital.

Early in 1893 the Minister of the Interior addressed a circular to each of the Governors in the Empire, which states: "Recognising the necessity to abolish the ordinances of my predecessors, I beg that your Excellency, without attempting to verify in detail the rights of the Jews domiciled in your Government, will take all needful measures so that every Jew who does not possess the right of residence in a province of the Interior, may emigrate to the Pale."

This blow was aimed at such Jews, numbering 30,000 to 40,000, who were specially privileged to reside in the cities outside of the Pale, and particularly in Riga and Libau. "Skilled artisans," according to a ukase of Alexander II., dated 1865, were permitted to dwell outside of the Pale. But what are we to understand by a "Skilled

Artisan" according to the Russian definition? Count Ignatieff had expelled from Kiev as "unskilled" those Jewish artisans who were not in receipt of continuous employment!

In 1892 it was announced that Jewish workmen would only be allowed to reside in such places where they could be controlled by a labour bureau, notwithstanding that these bureaux only exist in 10 to 15 per cent. of the towns. Further, Jewish workmen were expected to pursue their occupations without the slightest rest or cessation if they desired to retain the privilege of living outside the precincts of the Pale. If the domiciliary visit happened to be made while the artisan was absent from his workshop, he was immediately ordered off to the Pale, for having fraudulently described himself as "a skilled labourer"; and if the inspection happened to be made on his Sabbath, a similar fate was in store for him. With regard to the schools, M. Erréra shows that "the Jewish secondary schools were closed at the Imperial command, and that it was forbidden to establish new ones," under the pretext that the public schools are open to all. Notwithstanding this prohibition, the proportion of admissible pupils to the public schools has been persistently diminished.

In 1882 the number of Jewish students at the School of Medicine was limited to 5 per cent. At the present day no Jews are admitted! In 1883 only 5 per cent. were to be admitted to the Schools of Mines. Since 1885 only 10 per cent. have been admitted to the Art and Science Schools at Kharkow. In the same year Jews were excluded from participating in all public scholarships. In 1886 they were excluded from the Veterinary Schools. In 1887 the proportion of Jewish students at the School of Engineers was limited to 3 per cent. In December, 1886, came the *coup de grâce*. "Seeing that a very large number of Jews annually present themselves for admission, that they pass their examinations, and then continue their studies at the various schools of Europe, it seems preferable to put an end to such an undesirable state of things" (!); which meant that further restrictions must be put to those who desired the benefits of education as a redemption from ignorance.

Therefore the maximum which was thenceforth to be admitted at the St. Petersburg and Moscow Universities was limited to 3 per cent.; at various Universities within the Pale, to 10 per cent.; and at the Universities in the provinces, to 5 per cent. In July, 1887, a similar measure was passed regarding all gymnasiums, and in 1893 the Minister of the Interior decided to enforce the same decree on students of Surgical Schools, on those of Dentistry and Midwifery, as also on all other establishments for the pursuit of special studies.

Circulars were even addressed to school-mistresses enjoining

them not to receive Jewish girls at their institutions. The mental darkness which must ensue, is only a part of those cruel methods which condemn numberless innocent people to suffer from pangs of unappeasable hunger both of body and soul, until they succumb to the grim death which stalks after its victims, and mows them down in thousands within that Pale in which they are imprisoned. This is graphically described by M. Leroy Beaulieu, who, in his historical work, *Israel amongst the Nations*, says: "Far from the sight of a Sovereign justly loved for his goodness, are condemned down there three or four millions of the Czar's subjects."

M. Erréra next details the various petty accusations brought against the Jews, by which their enemies seek in some measure to justify the horrible sufferings which they inflict upon these four millions of people.

1. They are accused of usury and of injuring the poor Moujiks.
2. They are Innkeepers, and promote drunkenness.
3. When engaged in commercial pursuits, they are guilty of fraud and trickery.
4. They endeavour to escape military service, and are not good soldiers.
5. They are mere parasites and intermediaries, and refuse to perform manual labour, etc., etc.

"We must however," says M. Erréra, "keep clear of the error of imagining that the populace have any real dislike to the Jews; the animosity displayed to them comes from above and not from below." "It continually happens that the Russian peasants protect the Jews against the police and give them shelter." The *Novoïe Vremia* actually complains of this conduct on the part of the peasantry.

In many districts the poor peasants and burghers have generally come to the aid of the unhappy Israelites. This is confirmed by the *Sievérnoi Viestnik*, the Journal of the North. "The causes of Antisemitism in Russia," says M. Erréra, "are numerous, and come under religious, political, and economical headings." But in the highest circles it is evident that religion is the cause of persecution; Catholics and Protestants are also disliked, and if they are less cruelly treated than the Jews "it is for fear of diplomatic complications." Towards its Jewish subjects Russia need have no such scruples, they are treated as foreigners, and no Ambassador, or Minister, or Nuncio, will come to their succour! and yet, as M. Erréra points out, many of the educational establishments from which they are now excluded were founded and mainly supported by Jews. With regard to the hospitals, the sick are frequently refused admission, for no reason except that they are Jews. In-

credible as this may appear, it is an absolute fact. Messrs. Weber and Kempster relate the following incident in their report :—

“About two months before our visit, the Mayor of Moscow had addressed a circular to all the hospitals which are placed under the jurisdiction of the Municipal Authorities, ordering that no Jew should be admitted for treatment, whether residing in Moscow or not.” Madme. —having taken an old man to the “Hospital for the Eyes and Ears,” “because he had lost one eye and the other was threatened with cataract, they refused to attend him because he was a Jew.” “Later on, we saw the same old man in the street, where he was being hidden away, and he confirmed this account.” “His condition was one of the saddest possible, for paralysis had attacked him in addition to his other sufferings.” “All members of the artisan guild have to pay a hospital tax, in order that they may be enabled to receive medical treatment; but this does not in any way invalidate the circular which prohibits the admission of Jews.” “It is well known,” says M. Erréra, “that the Convention of Geneva prescribed that medical aid and medical care should be given to all who were sick and wounded, without distinction.” “But the Russian Government treats its Jewish subjects who are born in Russia and who serve in the army, in such a manner as no civilised nation would dare to behave to its enemies, even in time of war.”

It is needless to dwell on the consequences of such treatment, which M. Erréra describes at length, and in moving terms. Of the terrible conditions of starvation to which the Jews are condemned, ample evidence is given even by the journals and writers who are notoriously Anti-semitic. The *Journal (Russe) du Nord* does not hesitate to own quite frankly, that the “Jews in the south-west provinces are literally dying of starvation.” The *Vilna Journal*, one of the most violent Anti-semitic papers says, “The poverty amongst Jewish workmen and artisans has attained considerable proportions.” “A Jewish cobbler had lived for many weeks on raw potatoes, until he became dangerously ill; another Jew, a weaver, died of starvation while engaged at his daily work on the loom.” “One hardly has the heart to review the miserable lives of all these white slaves.” “Some work for eighteen hours, only taking rest during three hours, and yet they cannot earn sufficient to procure necessary food. They live in old tumble-down hovels, badly ventilated, and filth is everywhere, both inside and outside of the habitations.” “In one and the same dwelling are to be found herded together, four, five, or even six families, each of them having a great number of children, of tender age.” “Besides this, their dwellings possess neither beds, nor tables, nor chairs, and all that these poor creatures can sleep upon is the

damp and tainted earth, and many of them, even on the Sabbath, never have any meat included in their bill of fare; to-day they have bread and water, to-morrow water and bread, and so on day after day."

In Berditchev, as M. Touravski has shown in his *Description of the Government of Kiev*, which was quoted in an article of Lanin's, tens of thousands have no fixed occupation, but must live from hand to mouth from one day to another. "Several families are often crowded into one or two rooms of a hut which is usually half in ruins, and to such an extent are they packed that there is absolutely not an inch of space between the sleeping inhabitants at night."

"At Kovno there are Jewish families who usually break their daily fast at night, but then only if the father has been fortunate enough to find work during the day and has been paid for it."

"At Odessa, families of seven and eight individuals have to be fed on 40 copecks a day, and thousands of fathers and mothers deem themselves happy when this sum has been earned."

The *Journal (Russe) du Nord* says of the Jews, "There are only ten to fifteen thousands of Jews in Russia who possess any means; as to the masses they have nothing, they possess nothing, they are far below Christians of the same status, who at least can own some land." "When we call to mind the crushing misery under which the Jews are compelled to wear out their miserable existence, the stereotyped accusation of their being usurers, seems simply absurd." M. Leroy-Beaulieu says that as nine-tenths of the people own nothing, and live from hand to mouth, they absolutely have no money to lend; whilst the remaining population are only artisans. "But if we put it at the highest figure, perhaps one-tenth may be enabled to gain a small amount by lending a part of their savings." M. Erréra goes on to say, that the Jews are compelled to remain within the same narrow limits, they are practically shut out from all employment, and certainly from all the higher ranges of work; and then they are blamed because they devote themselves to the only means of livelihood left open to them. When, however, we examine the charges of usury raised against them, we find that the Jews actually take a smaller rate of interest than does the Russian usurer in the provinces where the Jews are not permitted to reside; less than the Popes and their wives (who also participate in this business), and less even than the Russian authorities, for this is expressly stated in the *Volkshod* of July, 1893.

The *Novoie Vremia* of October, 1893, in speaking of the Jews who had been hunted out of the villages in accordance with

the restrictions of the 'May Laws,' says, "We hear from Baranovka in Volhymnia, that the expulsion of Jews from the villages in the country is carried on with great severity and rigour . . . In our village not a single Jew is now tolerated, formerly we had fifty of them amongst us . . . The peasants, however, are not happy at their departure, they have fallen into the hands of Christian usurers, who squeeze them and ruin them with greater cunning than the Jews ever showed." " . . . Our peasants are often pressed for money, and these new usurers will only lend at the rate of 100 per cent. or 150 per cent. per annum." " . . . Thus the departure of the Jews is greatly regretted by those peasants who are obliged to borrow money." "Only a short time since the *Grajdanin*, a violently Anti-semitic paper, went so far as to demand the return of the Jews to the villages, and not only to those situated within the Pale of Settlement, but throughout the entire empire."

M. Erréra rightly observes that when organs so thoroughly hostile to the Jews regret their departure, we may take it that the Jewish question is settled beyond a doubt. As to the unfairness and trickery with which the Jew is charged in his commercial transactions, we find, when comparing his proceedings with those of his Christian fellow-countrymen, that the Jew is far less grasping than they are, and, in fact, it has been said that "the Jew might well go to school and learn of the Russians." With respect to military service, it is an undisputable fact that the Russian Jews furnish more soldiers to the army, in proportion to their numbers, than the rest of the population. Through the continual migrations to which the Jews of Russia are subjected, it often happens that "the same man is inscribed as a native of his actual birthplace and of his successive residences." This gives rise to many errors, which cannot occur in the case of non-Jews who are permitted to remain in their native places.

Further, the Russian authorities, who strictly forbid the Jews to give their children Christian names, have but a very slight acquaintance with Hebraic nomenclature, and frequently enrol the same young man as a conscript under his proper name, and again under the same name wrongly spelt; or a girl's name is mistaken for that of a man; and though the error may be discovered, the ordinary fine of 300 roubles is nevertheless inflicted.

"The Jews are all the more likely to be the victims of such mistakes seeing that an imperial interdict forbids their being nominated as members of the recruiting commission of the towns in which they may be dwelling." Once in military service, the Jewish soldiers can be ill-treated and knocked about with impunity by their

Christian companions, and the officers, instead of protecting them, always display the greatest severity towards them.

A ukase of June 25th, 1867, permitted Jewish veterans to establish themselves beyond the limits of the Pale ; but hardly had compulsory service been imposed on the Jews, than this privilege was taken from them. "The old soldiers who had been wounded in the service of their country, and who had actually been decorated in recognition of such service, were ordered off to the Pale with the greatest ignominy." And this is the reward which it is thought fitting to bestow on merit when it is displayed by the Jewish citizens of Russia ! Notwithstanding the palpable injustice of such conduct, the Jews enrol themselves in thousands under the Russian standard, and loyally endeavour to perform their duty to their thankless country.

With regard to the charges that the Jews are unfit for agriculture or manual labour, M. Erréra disproves this assertion by statistics, which show that 15 per cent. of the Jewish population of Russia are skilled artisans and labourers of various degrees, which as he says, is an immense proportion. In Prussia the artisans and labourers only constitute 9·1 per cent. of the entire population ; in France, 10·6 per cent. ; in Belgium, in 1890, there were 10·8 per cent. of male labourers, and 14·3 per cent. of the two sexes. England alone shows a higher ratio than that of Jewish Russia, namely 22·7 per cent. In "Orthodox" Russia we find the proportion of artisans and labourers in 1870 did not amount to 1 per cent. in forty Governments, and only attained to 1 and 2 per cent. in eight of the Governments ; in Moscow alone, the percentage attained to 3 per cent.

Regarding agriculture, Messrs. Weber and Kempster, the American Commissioners, publish extracts of a Russian report approved by the Censor, in which it is stated with respect to Jewish colonists, "If we consider all the difficulties and wretchedness which first colonists must encounter we can affirm that the Jews have proved, in a manner more than satisfactory, their aptitude for agriculture." "In the colonies of Ekaterinoslav there is a population of 5,000 souls, where all labour is performed exclusively by Jews." "There can be no better argument brought forward than this fact, in answer to persons who maintain that Jews are incapable of manual pursuits or of agricultural labour."

M. Erréra, in speaking of the alleged want of patriotism of the Jewish populace, quotes the remark made by Tertullian in bygone centuries, when the same reproach was brought against the early Christians by their opponents ; "We bear arms for you," said Tertullian, "we cultivate the ground for you, we traffic with you and as you do, and if we do not assist at your ceremonials are we any the less your fellow-citizens ?"

Having disposed of the various accusations brought against the Jews, by uncontrovertible evidence, and by statistics which cannot well be questioned, the author cites the evidence of those writers and statesmen, who possess the courage of their opinions to a sufficient extent, to testify in favour of the Jews. In 1812 the Commission over which Count Pahlen presided gave a favourable report of the Jews, and protested against the restrictions placed upon their rights, showing at the same time that their well-being and that of Orthodox Russia were indissolubly connected.

In 1858, when a calumny was levelled against two Jewish journalists, 147 professors and Christian authors signed a protest in reply, which was published. Amongst the names of the signatories were those of Katkoff, Aksakoff, Menschikoff, Tourgenief, etc. This document was reprinted in the *Novosti* of November 6th, 1890, but its circulation was forbidden by the public Censor. Another declaration, headed by Count Tolstoi, and which condemned the prevailing persecutions, was published in 1890. This manifesto was likewise prohibited to be circulated by the Censor, and the document only reached the public through its reproduction in a German newspaper.

M. Erréra lastly treats of the possible solutions of the Jewish question, which he places under four headings :—

1. Extermination.
2. Baptism, *en masse*.
3. Emigration.
4. Emancipation and Migration into the Interior of Russia.

With regard to the idea of a wholesale extermination of the Jews in Russia, M. Erréra maintains that, though there is a certain amount of barbarism still existent, even at the close of this nineteenth century, it would nevertheless be impossible to return to the old brutal days of destruction by fire and sword, and therefore a slower system has been adopted, though one equally efficacious. Through the instrumentality of famine and overcrowding, and aided by the diseases which such conditions of life engender, a great diminution must ensue in the ranks of the enemy, but, as he argues, this is not a "Solution"; for centuries must elapse before the Jew would be actually rooted out, and to employ time as an auxiliary, must, as he rightly observes, defeat the object in view, for "Time fights in favour of religious tolerance, and though its victory may be delayed, it is none the less a certainty."

Baptism, *en masse*, M. Erréra considers an impossibility. First, because the Jews as a body would never accept this alternative, and secondly because the Russians themselves do not at heart desire it. In 1891, when the expulsions from Moscow took place, "it is said

that 3,000 Jews solicited baptism, but only a few obtained it." And these converts had to pass three years within the Pale, or in such places designated to them, where they could be under the surveillance of the Russian popes, who supervised the sincerity of their conversion.

With regard to Emigration, it has been calculated that 300,000 Jews have already found a home in the United States, within recent years. The "Jewish Colonisation Society," instituted and nobly subventioned by Baron de Hirsch, has also for its object the colonising of Argentina with Russian refugees; but, as M. Erréra says, even if it were possible to transport 25,000 Jews annually to the Argentina (which cannot be done), such a course would hardly absorb half the Jewish population who are yearly compelled to leave Russia, and therefore the Utopian idea of a wholesale exodus to Argentina or elsewhere, must be relinquished.

Emancipation and Migration into the Interior, M. Erréra considers as a possible resource, and one which has received the serious consideration both of Russians and also of strangers. This last practical suggestion is to open up the enormous tracts of land situated in the interior of Russia, and the area of which is actually greater than that of Europe. Together with this, freedom of locomotion should be permitted, and choice of occupation. "No new edicts or ordinances would be required to promote migration into the interior," says M. Erréra; "the Jews would infinitely prefer to be allowed to live in peace in their native country, than to be banished to unknown parts. The decongestion of the Pale, and of Poland, would ensue immediately, and a fertilising current would deposit the germs of future riches and prosperity from the Vistula to the banks of the Amur."

It has been said that the Jewish question is a matter for Russia alone, and that the foreigner has no right to interfere in it; but the Irish, the Roumanians in Transylvania, the Christians in China, and many others, have not been abandoned by Europe because the susceptibilities of China, or of Hungary, or of England might be aroused. And yet the situation of these oppressed people, cannot in any way bear comparison, with the far more terrible position of the Russian Jews. Besides which, they all have their natural protectors, in the Irish members of Parliament, in the Roumanian Government, in all the diplomats of Christendom. "In Russia itself do we not see that all Dissenters can find some defender who will take their cause in hand, in opposition to Orthodoxy?" "Mahometans, Catholics, and Protestants have respectively the support of a Sultan, a Pope, or an Emperor." "The Jews alone are left utterly without defence."

Ten years ago, already, the Duke of Argyll said, "For them there

is no resource but public opinion." "If some heathen nation, living in the depths of Africa, were to suffer as the Russian Jews do, it would be our duty to intervene; why then should not this duty be fulfilled with respect to so remarkable a race as that of the Jews?" So said the universally-esteemed Cardinal Manning. It is not only the right of Europe to occupy itself with their situation, but it has become a *sacred* duty, and the material interests of the nations command it no less than their moral principles.

In 1860, Provost Paradol maintained that if the Jews should continue to suffer from persecution they would see "their cause taken in hand, and their oppressors scathed by the fiery indignation of the whole civilized world."

M. Erréra concludes with an earnest appeal to all the nations. He urges them to come forward, and to protest as with one voice against the unutterable misery and unwarrantable suffering which at the present time, and for long years past, have been mercilessly inflicted upon millions of innocent people.

BELLA LÖWY.
